## APPENDIX D.\*

## Brouillons for 'Political Economy—Analysis' (26–29 August 1801)

[099\_186] [26 August 1801]

## Analysis<sup>1</sup>

**1.**<sup>2</sup> Causes of Wealth.

I. Final—Well-being.

II. Material-Matter.

III. Efficient—Motion.

2. I. Final Cause Well-being, its-modifications, arranged in the order of their importance, are

1. Subsistence—(present).

2. Security in respect of i. Future subsistence. ii. Defence.

3. Enjoyment—mere enjoyment, distinct from subsistence.

3. II. Matter.

I. Sources.

1. Land (dry).

<sup>\* [</sup>Editor's Note: Bentham drafted this series of brouillons containing consecutively numbered paragraphs between 26 and 29 August 1801, just before drafting the discussion in Appendix C to which it broadly corresponds at UC xvii. xvii. 221–7, 183–4, 228–9, 186–8, 230, 189–90, 239, 231–4, which he completed between 30 August and 2 September 1801. The brouillons are included in the present volume on the ground that they shed further light on that discussion, and serve to demonstrate that in drafting 'Method and Leading Features of an Institute of Political Economy' Bentham revisited both the materials used and the approach adopted in his effort to map the field of political economy in the mid-1780s.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This appendix reproduces the text from three folios headed 'Polit. Economy Analysis', dated 26, 27, and 29 August 1801, on which Bentham detailed his intended analysis of the field of political economy in a series of numbered paragraphs. In that Bentham added additional numbered paragraphs and deleted others without consistently altering his enumeration, the final ordering is, albeit to a limited extent, conjectural. For further details see the Editorial introduction, pp. 000–00 above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For text corresponding in varying degrees to the order and substance of this Appendix see Appendix C, pp. 000–000 above. [To UC xvii. 221–7, 183–4, 228–9, 186–8, 230, 189–90, 239, 231–4, Appendix C]

- 2. Water, i:e: Land covered with water.
- **4.** II. [Matter—]Modifications or states.
- 1. Unimproved: viz: i. Mineral. ii. Vegetable. iii. Animal.
- **5.** III. Motion.
- 1. Sources or Primum Mobiles.
- i. Inanimate.
- ii. Animate.
- 6. Inanimate.
- 1. Liquids by [i.] gravity.
- ii.—by expansion and contraction.
- iii.—by expansion into gas (steam) by union with caloric and re-contraction.
- 2. Air atmospherical by
- i. Gravity-Expansion and contraction-Wind.
- 7. Animate—of Animals.
- 1. Irrational—viz. cattle.
- 2. Rational—Man—viz. by Labour.

**8.** [IV.] Operations, modifications of [Motion], the efficient cause, acting upon a modification or modifications of Matter, the material cause, with a view to a modification or modifications of [Well-being], the final cause, are<sup>3</sup>

- '4. Naturalization (in case of vegetables).
- '5. Improvement.
- '6. Preservation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The following alternative draft appears at this point: **'9.** Operations being so many ways of applying labour to materials.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;1. Discovery.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;2. Extraction.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;3. Importation (if the place be exterior to the territory in question).

## 1. Discovery.<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Examples of Discovery without.

2. Extraction.<sup>b</sup>

<sup>b</sup>Extraction[?]—Celestial bodies.

3. Importation, if the spot from whence the extracted be exterior to the territory in question.

4. Naturalization (in case of vegetables and animals).

5. Improvement.

5.\* Rectification.—Purification of water.

6. Preservation.

7. Propagation of: i. Vegetables. ii. Animals, viz: by permission of sexual intercourse. Propagation is to extraction what Exportation is to Importation.

8. Conveyance local [or] national.

9. Conveyance legal. (Conveyance of the legal right of employing the thing.)

10. Exportation.

10.\* Weighing and measuring and counting: i:e: ascertaining quantities.

11. Use.

12. Formation (Fabrication a species of it).

**9.** In every Operation Land (dry or covered with water), Materials (moveable portions of the substance or produce of land), and Labour must be jointly concerned.<sup>c</sup> Whatever be the Operation (Common Operation), it must be performed by human labour, on a certain set of materials, resting or moving on a certain spot of land. But, as neither land can be acted upon or made subservient to human use or well-being but by labour, nor materials prepared for use, nor so much as extracted,

<sup>&#</sup>x27;7. Local conveyance.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;8. Exchange.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;9. Exportation.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;10. Employment.'

without labour—in that respect labour may be considered the sole source of wealth—and every modification of wealth may be referred to labour as to its *efficient cause*.

<sup>c</sup> Motion = Labour. Matter = Materials.

**10.** All encrease—all Motion—referable to Labour.

Though labour (human labour) is but one of several sources of motion, yet still, what ever is derived from any of the other sources, towards the encrease of wealth, may be referred to human labour as its cause: because motion, when produced from any of these other sources, though it thereby saves a proportion of the human labour which would have been required to produce the effect without their assistance, still labour non-human, in so far as it is made subservient to any of those ends which human labour proposes to itself, requires a concomitant portion of human labour to give it birth, or direction, or both.

All modes of giving encrease to wealth, are referrable to labour: to the encreasing of labour, or husbanding (i:e: preserving) the fruit or produce of it.

NOTE TO TYPESETTERS: Please apply braces linking 'real' and 'pecuniary' as indicated in hard copy attached.

Capital is the fruit or produce of antecedent labour, applied, in conjunction with present labour, to the giving encrease—positive or negative—to the existing mass of wealth.

**12.** Capital is either real (physical) or else pecuniary, i:e: money.

Real is either

- 1. Stock employ'd or productive.
- 2. Stock produced (Finished work).

**13.** Pecuniary capital—money employ'd as capital—officiates in that character by being given in exchange for the articles of [which] real capital is composed, or for the labour by which they are rendered subservient to the end in view, which is the final cause of the establishment.

**14.** Preservation = negative encrease.

Encrease of wealth is either *positive* or *negative*: effected by operations of the positive cast, or by operations of the negative cast.

1. Positive encrease is by production.

2. Negative encrease is by preservation.

**15.** Preservation is either by immediate agency or by remote agency.

**16.** Preservation by *immediate* agency is by counteracting the influence of the causes of depirition or disappearance. Preservation by remote agency is by destroying or removing the instruments of which the agency is the cause of destruction.

NOTE TO TYPESETTERS: In the following paragraph, please apply braces linking '1. Immediate' and '2. Subservient' as indicated in hard copy attached.

An article of wealth is either of immediate or remote (or, say subservient) *use*: immediate, where it is itself applicable to one or other of the three ends—subsistence, security or enjoyment—remote or subservient where it contributes no otherwise to any of them than with reference to some other article which is of immediate use, and which it renders, or contributes to render, applicable to Real use.

**18.** Articles of subservient or remote use may be distinguished into articles of which the subserviency is of the first, second, third removes, and so on, with reference to articles of immediate use.

**19.** Articles of subservient use are:

1. Ground—(portions of land for a basis[?] or substratum).

- 2. Receptacles.
- 3. Materials.
- 4. Instruments.
- **20.** Instruments are:

1. Tools.

2. Machines (having parts that are fixed:<sup>d</sup> either i. absolutely, or ii. with relation to the rest.

<sup>d</sup> Fixed are 1. Supports and Head-masts[?].

2. Guides.

21. Receptacles are either

1. Immediate (with reference to the thing contained in them) or

2. Remote—which may be of the 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, or 3<sup>rd</sup> remove, and so on.

22. Receptacles (of the last remove) are either:

**23.** 1. Stationary, or 2. Ambulatory.

Stationary are either

i. Erections.

ii. Excavations.

Ambulatory are

i. Carriages (Land carriages).

ii. Vessels (Water carriages).

24. Money an article of subservient use with reference to things vendible.

[099\_187] [27 August 1801]

**25.** Agents. Beings considered as sources of motion are termed Agents.

**26.** Agents considered in respect of the degree in which the effect is dependent on their action are

1. Principal, or

2. Subordinate.

27. Among agents, all that are not animals, and among animals all that are not human are, of course, subordinate.

**28.** Among human agents, every individual is subordinate with reference to those of whom is composed the government under which he lives.

**29.** I. Discovery Corporal.

Objects of Discovery—in respect to individual things themselves in the forms in which they exist previous to the discovery.

1. Portion of Land.

**30.** 2. All bodies in an unimproved state. viz:

i. Mineral.

ii. Vegetable.

iii. Animal.

**31.** 3. Articles in an improved or even factitious state, in the event of their having been lost: i.e. so circumstanced that either their existence or their situation is unknown.

**32.** 4. Celestial Bodies. See Extraction [40].<sup>4</sup>

**33.** II. [Discovery] Ideal.

1. Modes[?] of giving birth to things of a new form or species.

**34.** 2. Extraction—Modes.

By extraction is meant separation of a thing from the body which is its natural source, viz. Land, dry or covered with water.

35. Examples of it are—as applied to

1. Minerals.

i. Digging out.

ii. Pounding.

iii. Smelting.

iv. Carrying away.

36. 2. Vegetables.

i. Felling (Timber).

ii. Cutting (Herbs[?]).

iii. Gathering Fruits.

iv. Digging up Roots.

**37.** 3. Animals. Beasts or Birds.

i. Catching by the chase.

ii.—by shooting.

iii.—by deceipt, as by traps, bait &c.

iv. Catching fish in any of the above or other ways.

**38.** 2. Extraction.—3. Importation.

A portion of matter considered as a raw material is either of home growth or foreign growth.

**39.** In case of home growth, an operation necessary to be performed in all cases, and the first that is necessary in all cases, is Extraction.

**40.** In this case, an operation by which that of Extraction is preceded in some cases, not preceded in others, is Discovery. See [**29**].<sup>5</sup>

**41.** If of foreign growth, then the first operation that comes to be performed upon it on *home* ground, is Importation: which is to  $[foreign]^6$  articles what extraction is to  $[home]^7$  articles.

42. 4. Naturalization. 5. Improvement. [6.] Preservation.

4. Naturalization supposes previous importation, either of the individual article itself or of the parent stock.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> MS '32'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> MS 'home'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> MS 'foreign'.

43. It is a sort of negative improvement: the absence of deperition or deterioration.

44. 5. Improvement is a title applicable to home-produced and imported articles.

**45.** 6. Preservation is a sort of negative improvement: it is the absence of deperition and deterioration.

Sources of distinctions belonging to this head-

1. Qualities in respect of which the deterioration may take place.

2. Efficient causes of the deterioration or deperition.<sup>8</sup>

NOTE TO TYPESETTERS: In the following paragraph, please supply braces connecting 'Physical' and 'Legal' as shown in hard copy attached.

**46.** Conveyance

Physical

7. Conveyance (local).

The labour employ'd in conveyance is a charge bearing in a greater or less degree on almost every article home-produced or imported—improved or unimproved—on every article except the fruit a man plucks and eats as he sits under 'his own vine or his own fig tree'.<sup>9</sup>

**47.** 8. Conveyance (legal) of the rights of property concerning the article form one proprietor to another.

**48.** This species of conveyance is a natural and usual accompaniment of the other, but not a necessary one. Rum may go from a man's plantation in Jamaica to his house in London without change of proprietorship. A table may be sold or given by the inhabitant of one room in a house to the inhabitant of the next, with very little change of place.

49.9. Exportation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> At the end of his text at UC xcix. 188, Bentham added the following unnumbered paragraphs concerning preservation: 'Preservation is:

<sup>&#</sup>x27;1.- for consumption as in cases of articles that are of use no otherwise than as consumed-as food, drink &c.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;2.--against consumption or say deperition as in cases of Houses furniture, cloaths &c.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> 2 Kings 18: 31; Isaiah 36: 16.

9. Exportation. By exportation of any article—of any part of the matter of wealth—from the home country to a foreign country, the mass of wealth in the home country can not, in a direct way, receive any encrease.

**50.** But, except in the case where a thing is exported *gratis* from the home country to the foreign country (as in the case of a gift, a tribute or a pledge), exportation from the home country is an event necessarily connected, either as a condition precedent or a condition subsequent, with *importation* into it.

**51.** 10. Employment.

An article of rude produce may be employ'd by being employ'd either in the way of *immediate use*, or in the way subservient or remote use.

**52.** Employed in either way, it will be employed in the way either of prompt consumption or consumption more or less slow and gradual, according to its nature.

**53.** Of employment in the way of subservient use, whatsoever is not included in Extraction, may be referred to fabrication.

54. A branch of fabrication is *manufacturing*, but the word manufacturing is seldom applied but[?] on the supposition that this article, when fabricated, is destined to become the subject matter of exchange in a commercial way—in the way of trade.

[099\_188] [29 August 1801]

NOTE TO TYPESETTERS: In the following paragraph, please supply braces linking 'encreasing' and 'diminishing' as shown in hard copy attached.

**55.** Labour diminishin

All other circumstances given, the quantity of wealth produced within a given time will be as the quantity of labour.

56. But, taking each branch of industry separately, the quantity of wealth produced by labour within a given time being given, the quantity of wealth produced in the whole community in that time, will naturally be inversely as the quantity of labour exerted in that branch: because the less labour is bestowed in any particular branch, or say the greater the quantity of labour withdrawn from any particular branch—the quantity of wealth produced in it not being thereby diminishedthe more is left free to be employ'd in other branches.

**57.** This gives the solution of what otherwise might seem a paradox: viz: that wealth is encreased, as well by diminution of labour as by the encrease of it.

NOTE TO TYPESETTERS: In the following paragraph, please supply braces linking 'Quantity' and 'Efficiency' as shown in hard copy attached.

**58.** Labour Efficiency.

In every instance where an encrease in the quantity of wealth has been produced, an encrease in the quantity of labour bestowed has been contributory to that encrease—or say an efficient cause of it—or not: if not, if the encrease has not been in the quantity of labour so bestowed, it has been in the efficiency of the quantity of labour so bestowed.

The division is therefore an exhaustive one.

59. Large Scale.

Ways in which the concentration of a large mass of capital in one set of hands—that is under one management—is favourable to the encrease of wealth.

1.<sup>10</sup> Division of Labour—thence encrease of skill in regard to each operation. A. Smith.<sup>11</sup>

2.<sup>12</sup> Division of Labour—thence saving goings and comings—expence of conveyance in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink at this point: 'N° 15'. The reference is to 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse', originally drafted for 'Projet Matière', and revisited by Bentham in drafting 'Institute of Political Economy': see UC xcix. 189. A version of the table, in Dumont's hand with corrections by Bentham, is included in *Writings on Political Economy*: I (*CW*), pp. 40–1. Paragraph 15 is as follows: 'Augmenter la dextérité et le savoir-faire dans chaque travailleur. Division du travail: soit Distribution des procédés. Causée par la grandeur des capitaux' (ibid. p. 40).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See Smith, Wealth of Nations (Glasgow Edition), (Bk. I, Ch. I) i. 17–18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this paragraph: 'N° 16. II. 4'. The references are to 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse', for details of which see the previous note, although the first reference is a slip, since paragraph 16 of that table refers not to savings in comings and goings but to increasing the number of productive workers, while Bentham presumably had in mind instead paragraph 15, for which see previous note. The second reference is to paragraph 4 of the second series in the table, i.e. 'Manières d'augmenter l'effet du travail': 'Épargne du tems à emploier en allées et venues [.^.?.?] de l'endroit d'un procédé à l'endroit dun autre. Moyens incitatif non-requis: Moyen facilitant, Division du travail.' (*Writings on Political Economy*: I (*CW*), p. 41).

minute distances. A. Sm[ith].<sup>13</sup>

3.<sup>14</sup> Introduction of machinery—thence substitution of agents less expensive than man in the character prime movers (sources of motion) and *guides*.

4.<sup>15</sup> Saving in respect of receptacles: the ratio of containing matter to contained space being less and less in proportion as the receptacle is greater and greater.

5. Saving in respect of fragments of labour on the part of the managing hands, and other hands constantly paid for. In a small establishment, if there is more work than can be done by two, three must be retained, although there be not a quarter enough work to fill up the time of the third.

6. Like saving in respect of cattle and dead instruments (tools or machines) which are but occasionally in use.

7. Saving in respect of the employment of refuse articles: articles which, if disposed in several establishments and situations, would be hardly worth collecting, but which possess a value worth regarding when ready collected in one.

8.<sup>16</sup> Saving by purchases made at wholesale price. Not only the profit of the intermediate class or classes of dealers is thus saved, but the expence of conveyance from one to the other.

9.<sup>17</sup> Employment of cheaply paid hands. By means of the division of labour, employment may be found for hands of imperfect ability, for whom employment could not have been otherwise

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See Smith, Wealth of Nations (Glasgow Edition), (Bk. I, Ch. I) i. 18–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this paragraph: 'A. Sm. II. 5'. See, respectively, Smith, Wealth of Nations (Glasgow Edition), (Bk. I, Ch. I) i. 19–21, and 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse' (Writings on Political Economy: I (CW), p. 41): 'Acquisition des forces auxiliaires à celle du muscle humain (et des animaux) empoiées dans les préparations intermédiares. Premiers moteurs physiques: Eau—Air—Feu—Animaux. Ex. Chevaux en Taiti. Éléphans, Chameaux, cheveaux[?] en Amerique.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this and the following three paragraphs 'N° 0.', presumably an indication that these topics were not addressed in 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse'. Bentham had, however, discussed these extensively in his poor law writings: see *Writings on the Poor Laws*: I, ed. M. Quinn, Oxford, 2001 (*CW*), pp. 162 & n., 189, and *Writings on the Poor Laws*: II (*CW*), pp. 88, 501, 525, 678 n.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this paragraph 'N° 23'. The reference is to 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse', *Writings on Political Economy*: I (*CW*), p. 40: 'Augmentation de la masse des capitaux productifs'. Bentham had developed the 'Wholesale-purchase principle' in 'Outline of a work entitled Pauper Management Improved': see *Writings on the Poor Laws*: II (*CW*), p. 525.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this paragraph 'N° 16'. The reference is to 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse', *Writings on Political Economy*: I (*CW*), p. 40: 'Augmenter le nombre des travailleurs productifs par rapport au non-travailleurs et aux travailleurs non-productifs.'

found to advantage. Hence the labour of these hands may be obtained at a cheap rate with reference to the expence of the particular master, and perhaps even for nothing with reference to the expence of the community taken together: for the labourer thus maintained by the pay for which he [ .^.^?] pays in labour might otherwise have been to be kept for nothing.<sup>18</sup>

Apply this not to large manufactories only, but to large Farms.

10.<sup>19</sup> Applying to each work the hands best adapted to that work. The faculty of doing this will be as the *choice* of hands, and that as the number of hands.

11. In Agriculture, the faculty of making improvements rising one above another indefinitely in respect of the mass of capital required: ex gr: Manuring, draining, making Roads and other *Communications*.

So in regard to mining.

**60.** Ways in which and means whereby the expence (real expence) attending the exhibition[?] of any article at the place where it is wanted to be employ'd may be reduced.<sup>20</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> For Bentham's 'Universal-Industry' or 'All-employing' principle see *Writings on the Poor Laws*: II (*CW*), pp. 119–20, 518–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Bentham has noted in red ink above this paragraph 'N° 0.', presumably an indication that these topics were not addressed in 'Tableau général des moyens d'accroître la masse de la richesse'. Bentham had introduced a related 'Employment-appropriation' principle in his poor law writings: see *Writings on the Poor Laws*: II (*CW*), pp. 120, 519.
<sup>20</sup> The text breaks off at this point, and no enumeration of ways of reducing expense appears. For unnumbered

paragraphs dealing with preservation added at the end of this brouillon see p. 000 n. above. [To note to UC xcix. 187, this file]